

Analysis of Wholetime Recruitment Monitoring Data 2009

Report of the Chief Fire Officer

For further information about this report please contact Paul Raymond, Chief Fire Officer, on 01743 260203 or Jonathan Hyams, Equality and Diversity Officer, on 01743 260236.

1 Purpose of Report

To inform the Human Resources Committee of the equality outcomes of the recruitment of wholetime operational staff during 2009

2 Recommendations

The Committee is asked to note the contents of this report.

3 Background

Shropshire Fire and Rescue Service has diversity targets for the recruitment of wholetime operational staff. These are currently 15% women and 7% minority ethnic employees, rising to 18% women and 7% minority ethnic employees by 2013.

The ethnic minority population of the area of Shropshire Council is very low, with only 2.64% of people from ethnic minorities. The black and ethnic minority population of the area of Telford & Wrekin Council is 5.2%, with the combined ethnic minority population across both areas being 4.2% (updated 2001 Census data).

The Fire Service has a long history of employing men in operational roles. It is often seen by the general public as an area of work, which is not appropriate for women, and achieving change in public attitudes is complex, difficult and likely to take a significant time.

This Service has undertaken a wide range of positive action initiatives to encourage applications from women and people from ethnic minorities, including 'taster' sessions, targeted advertising, school and college visits, attending community events, physical fitness advice sessions and careers events.

The purpose of these activities is to enable under-represented groups to find out about a career in Fire Service, to dispel stereotypes and myths, and to encourage individuals to prepare themselves for the selection process. All applicants go through the same selection process, with no concessions for sex or ethnic origins.

4 Current Situation

The outcomes of the 2009 recruitment and selection process for wholetime operational staff are set out in the Appendix to this report. In summary, from a total of 857 applicants there were 46 women (5.4%), with 15 people - 14 of them men - from minority ethnic backgrounds (1.8%). Of these, 11 white women (27.5%) and 4 minority ethnic men (26.7%) had attended taster sessions.

10 women and 53 men (18% and 82% respectively) were shortlisted from application forms. Of these, 5 were from minority ethnic backgrounds.

Twelve recruits have been offered employment from the 2009/2010 wholetime recruitment campaign. The breakdown of their sex, ethnic origins, and ages¹ is as follows:

	Sex				Ethnic origins	Age		
	Male	%	Female	%		17 - 24	25 - 35	36 - 45
Total successful recruits	10	83	2	17	12 White British	6	5	1
Started September 2009	4	80	1	20	5 White British	1	3	1
Starting 4 January 2010	6	86	1	14	7 White British	5	2	0

The Appendix also contains breakdowns of the 2009/10 recruitment and selection process by disability, religion and sexual orientation.

It is suggested that by mid-2010 a review and evaluation of positive action programmes for women and members of ethnic minorities be undertaken.

¹ Analysis of disability, religion and sexual orientation has been excluded, because the low numbers might enable individual identification on these sensitive areas.

This would include:

- A detailed analysis of the reasons for people failing, or dropping out, at different stages of the selection process
- A questionnaire to all applicants about their experience of the recruitment and selection process, focusing on accessibility and equality issues
- A questionnaire to those, who took part in positive action events
- Discussion with West Midlands representatives from the Asian Fire Service Association about the appropriateness of our positive action programme to potential Asian recruits

In addition, we intend to discuss with Stonewall and Shropshire Lesbian, Gay and Bisexual (LGB) Network about the appropriateness of positive action programmes for local LGB people.

This year's wholetime recruitment and selection process was undertaken with a strong emphasis on positive action to attract women and members of ethnic minorities to apply and to enable them to engage in the process. This continues our efforts over the past four years to achieve a more representative staff profile overall. The process is, however, proving frustratingly slow to impact on the appointment of wholetime, and especially retained, firefighters.

Nevertheless, we remain strongly committed to continuing our work to reach out to under-represented sections of our communities in order to encourage and support applications for employment. This will include critically evaluating our own processes, and sharing best practice with other Fire Services and agencies and groups, who are doing similar positive action work.

5 Financial Implications

We have consulted with the Principal Accountant and are confident that any costs can be met from within existing budgets. Should it be necessary to increase emphasis on positive action during the coming year, there are sufficient funds in the relevant section of the Equality and Diversity budget to enable this to be done.

6 Legal Comment

There are no legal implications arising from this report.

7 Equality Impact Assessment

An Equality Impact Assessment has been completed on this report.

8 Appendix

Analysis of 2009 wholetime recruitment outcomes by age, disability, ethnic origin, gender, religion and sexual orientation

9 Background Papers

There are no background papers associated with this report.

Implications of all of the following have been considered and, where they are significant (i.e. marked with an asterisk); the implications are detailed within the report itself.

Balanced Score Card		Integrated Risk Management Planning	
Business Continuity Planning		Legal	*
Capacity		Member Involvement	
Civil Contingencies Act		National Framework	
Comprehensive Performance Assessment		Operational Assurance	
Efficiency Savings		Retained	
Environmental		Risk and Insurance	
Financial	*	Staff	*
Fire Control/Fire Link		Strategic Planning	
Information Communications and Technology		West Midlands Regional Management Board	
Freedom of Information / Data Protection / Environmental Information		Equality Impact Assessment	*



Directorate	HR, Training and Development	Department/Section	HR
Name of officers completing (minimum of 2)	Jonathan Hyams Lisa Vickers	Job title	E &D Officer HR Manager
Name of Policy/Service/Activity to be assessed	Analysis of wholetime recruitment monitoring data - 2009	Date of assessment	17 th December 2009
New or existing policy	E		

1) Briefly describe the aims, objectives and purpose of the policy/service/activity (referred to as policy in document) and also consider the following:

- What are the key performance indicators?
- Who is intended to benefit or be affected by it? (is this positive or negative)
- What outcomes do you want to achieve from this policy?

Shropshire Fire & Rescue Service has diversity targets for the recruitment of wholetime operational staff. These are currently 15% women and 7% minority ethnic employees, rising to 18% women and 7% minority ethnic employees by 2013.

This report details the outcome of the 2009 recruitment process for wholetime firefighters. 10 women and 53 men (18% and 82% respectively) were shortlisted from application forms. Of these, 5 were from minority ethnic backgrounds.

Twelve recruits have been offered employment as wholetime firefighters with SFRS. Of these, five started employment in September 2009 and seven are starting work in January 2010. Of these recruits two are women (20% of recruits), and none are from ethnic minorities.

The report suggests a review and evaluation of the recruitment and selection and positive action programmes to be undertaken by mid 2010.

1 a) Who implements this policy? Equality and Diversity, Human Relations, Operational and Training staff.

2) How does your current policy meet the needs around age, disability, race, religion/belief, gender, sexual orientation and caring responsibilities?

Are there any obvious barriers to accessing the service? E.g. physical or other.

The positive action process is designed to encourage applications from women and people from ethnic minorities.

The selection process is the same for all applicants, with appropriate adjustments to accommodate the needs of different applicants, such as translation and interpreting services and reasonable adjustments for disability.

Selection criteria are part of a national framework. They are designed to test factors such as physical fitness, strength, climbing ability. These are based on genuine



	occupational requirements.		
2a) Where do you think improvements could be made?			
2b) Have issues of equality been identified in this area of service delivery by SFRS?	Yes: positive action programmes are seen as essential in order to encourage and support applications from women and people from ethnic minorities, who are under-represented in our wholetime workforce.		
3) Have we had any specific feedback or complaints on this area? Is there evidence that this has come from any of these specific groups: race, gender, disability, religion/belief, age, sexual orientation, caring responsibilities?	Use of ladders as part of selection tests. A separate EQIA is in process to analyse this issue. Of particular relevance to women and anybody with a slight build.		
3a) Do we have any feedback from managers or frontline staff on this policy?			
3b) Is there any feedback from voluntary/community organisations?			
3c) Is there any research / models of practice that may inform SFRS view?	Positive action models from other FRS and public agencies		
4) Detail the Actions / Improvement areas you have identified, or the need for further research. (These must be put onto the Action and Improvements Form FB 367 for consideration by Steering Group) If you have found considerable actions or research this will require you to proceed to a full assessment.	A review and evaluation of positive action programmes be undertaken by mid-2010		
5) Should the policy now proceed to a full impact assessment?		N	.

I am satisfied that this policy has been successfully impact assessed. I understand the Impact Assessment of this policy is a statutory obligation and that, as owners of this policy, we take responsibility for the completion and quality of this process.

Line Manager	Lisa Vickers	Date	17 th December 2009
Please note that this impact assessment will be scrutinised by the Equality and Diversity Officer.			

Appendix D

Equality Impact Assessment Actions and Improvements Form

When you have completed the Equality Impact Assessment a number of actions or improvement areas will have been identified, it is important that these are captured and put into normal work activities. In some cases there maybe a few small actions required in other cases you will need to process to a full impact assessment, you will need to complete this form for both of these situations when you identify actions that need completing, or have identified that future investigation will require specific resources that need to be put into the business planning process.

This form is to allow you to record the outcome from your impact assessments so that the actions or improvements can be carried out by your Department and monitored and in some cases approved by the Equality and Diversity Steering Group. Please ensure that this form is given to your line manager for discussion at your team or one to one meetings for incorporation into individual work plans.

Directorate:	Department:
Brigade Order/activity that has identified need, issue/objective:	EQIA No:

Action	Comments inc. Details of Consultations required/carried out	Resources / Finances allocated to this objective/target	How will this be monitored to ensure it is effective	Responsible for this action	Due Date	Progress

Head of Department		Date completed	
---------------------------	--	-----------------------	--

This form must be sent to Management Support when completed for monitoring and/or consideration by the Equality & Diversity Steering Group

Analysis of 2009 wholetime recruitment outcomes by age, disability, ethnic origin, gender, religion and sexual orientation

NB Figures across different tables may not appear to be consistent because not all applicants completed all areas of the monitoring form, giving different totals for different areas.

Age

Band	Women	% band	Men	% band	Total at Stage 1	Successful Stage 2	
						Women	Men
17-24	15	7.2	193	92.8	208	3	26
25 - 35	21	12.3	150	87.7	171	5	21
36 - 45	5	10.4	43	89.6	48	1	3
46 - 55	0	0	2	100.0	2	0	0
56 - 65	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
66 +	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	41		388		429	9	50

Disability

Disabled Men	Disabled Women	Successful Men Stage 2	Successful Women Stage 2
4	1	1	1

Ethnic origin

	Total applicants	Women	% total applicants	Men	% total applicants	Tasters/ positive action	Successful Women Stage 2	Successful Men Stage 2
White British	437	39		398		11 women	8	44
White Irish	1	1		0			1	
White other	23	3		20	90.6		0	3
Mixed – white/ black Caribbean	4	0	0	4	100	1	0	1
Mixed – white/ black African	0	0		0				
Mixed – white/ / Asian	2	0	0	2	100		0	1
Mixed - other	1	0		1	100			0
Indian	2	0		2	100	1		1
Pakistani	2	0		2	100	1		1
Bangladeshi	0	0		0				
Asian other	1	0		1	100			0
Black Caribbean	1	0		1	100	1		0
Black African	1	0		1	100			0
Black other	0	0		0				
Chinese	0	0		0				
Other	0	0		0				

Gender (sex)

	No	Tasters/ positive action	Successful stage 1	Successful stage 2
Total applicants	498			
Female	46	11	44	10
Male	452	4	407	53
Transgender	0	0	0	0

Religion

Religion	Men Stage 1	Women Stage 1	Men Successful Stage 2	Successful Women Stage 2
Buddhist	0	0	0	0
Hindu	0	0	0	0
Muslim	3	0	1	
None	145	16	18	5
Christian	204	22	29	4
Jewish	0	0	0	0
Sikh	2	0	1	
Other	14	2	3	0

Sexual orientation

	Gay	Lesbian	Bisexual men	Bisexual women
Applicants	1	4	3	0
Successful Stage 2	0	1	0	0

Appointees from 2009/2010 wholetime recruitment campaign

Twelve recruits have been offered employment from the 2009/2010 wholetime recruitment campaign. The breakdown of their sex, ethnic origins, and ages¹ is as follows:

	Sex				Ethnic origins	Age		
	Male	%	Female	%		17 - 24	25 - 35	36 - 45
Total successful recruits	10	83	2	17	12 White British	6	5	1
Started September 2009	4	80	1	20	5 White British	1	3	1
Starting 4 th January 2010	6	86	1	14	7 White British	5	2	0

Key

Applicants = number of people that applied

Stage 1 = Number of people successful after SFRS sift of application forms

Stage 2 = Number of people successful after Fire Service College Sift of application forms

¹ Analysis of disability, religion and sexual orientation has been excluded, because the low numbers might enable individual identification on these sensitive areas.